



Minute of the Meeting of the Board of Directors
held on 7th May 2019, at Murrayfield Hotel.



Directors Present:

Rob Niven, Graham Lindsay, Jim Cullen, Susan Kesley, Hugh Templeton, Bruce Crawford, David Hardie, Brian McArtney

Apologies: Kevin Troup, Louise Burke, Helen Hally, Margaret Nicol

1. Welcome

Rob thanked everyone for coming to this extra meeting at short notice.

2. Conflicts of Interest

No new interests were noted.

3. Primary Issues For Discussion: Selection of Representative Teams

Rob thanked members for all the email input that was circulated prior to the meeting. He apologised for creating this extra meeting but there did seem to be genuine agreement that it was appropriate to do so and that it was the right thing for the good governance of the sport.

Rob summarised his thoughts and reflections following the 5th May board meeting, specifically with regards to the selection policy document on international representation.

The board had voted to adopt the policy document on selection for the European Championships by the three options listed by a selection panel with a Scottish Curling board member as an observer.

The board had voted against the adoption of the policy document for the selection of teams to the World Championships. The board then recommended that it should put the policy document to the membership at the AGM as a motion to be voted, giving the paper the board's full support.

Rob was pleased that the board listened to the presentation from British Curling and showed sound governance in their judgement, he was however uncomfortable, on reflection, with the decision to delegate the motion to the membership.

If the board put this vote to the membership, it is effectively saying that it cannot make this judgement without the ratification of the members, it will thereby lose sovereignty of this process indefinitely. Rob was also uncomfortable that the board would be putting a motion to the members that the board had rejected. Scottish Curling has a strong and enduring relationship with British Curling, sportscotland and UK Sport and this could drive a wedge between the partners and further consideration needs to be made in relation to the impact of the decision on this matter.

The message of rejecting the proposed policy is a strong one. It tells the membership that their board are not convinced by the current policy and it needs more work. The board do believe that the proposal does have merit, but it needs to be developed further through consultation with members and negotiation with British Curling. This can only be achieved by retaining control rather than handing it over to members who do not possess all of the facts and consequences.

4. Summary

The first decision that was made last week, that the board would not move to selection of teams to represent Scotland at World Championships, remains our position.

It was agreed that the decision to put a motion to the membership at the AGM had further ramifications that had not been fully considered, so it would not take place. A rushed vote by members at the 2019 AGM could set any process back through lack of knowledge, and there is realistically not enough time to progress this before the AGM.

It was agreed that this was not an attempt to delay the process but to allow timely consultation, and ensure that the sovereignty of this decision making stays with the board. A series of roadshows in the same vein as last year will be organised to include presentations on the structural review and selection of teams.

The Board agreed with the decision, made last Thursday, to support the policy on selection of teams to represent Scotland the European Curling Championships. Further reflections on the composition of the selection panel revealed concerns that an observer from the Board of Scottish Curling was not enough and that the Scottish Curling board should have a voting representative (not a director) on the selection panel. To keep the panel to three persons the votes would be held by the Performance Director, the National Coach and the Scottish Curling rep, with the performance analyst providing the evidence/data that supports the decision making process.

These decisions will be presented by Rob to the British Curling Board on 13th May.

Rob agreed to update those directors unable to attend and to confirm in writing the decisions made and strategy going forward. Meeting notes will be circulated with the minutes from the Board meeting on Thursday 2nd May.